POVERTY as ecology
(rarely just one thing: dynamic & cumulative)

Census Community Resilience Risk Factors: 10
Pima County Health Department: 28
City Health Dashboard: 37
County Health Rankings: 52

The more factors, the harder to get out of it
### Poverty as Environment

(Shows up in many areas of life)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Where you live</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Where you go to school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where you worship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What you do for a living</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who is your social support system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How healthy you are</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>How long you live</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*We live very economically segregated lives*
Pima County has a high poverty rate

Childhood poverty rates almost always exceed those for adults.
2020 POVERTY RATES

PIMA COUNTY
15.9% = 62,195
Figure 5: Child Opportunity Scores for the 100 largest metro areas
Neighborhoods have causal effects on children’s long-term outcomes

The differences we see in outcomes across neighborhoods are largely due to the causal effect of places, rather than differences in the characteristics of their residents.

Place-conscious policies to promote upward mobility should focus primarily on improving the local childhood environment rather than conditions in adulthood.

Raj Chetty, Nathaniel Hendren in the Quarterly Journal of Economics, Volume 133, Issue 3, August 2018,
“Upstream Solutions”

1. **Preventing** poverty
2. **Alleviating** suffering
3. **Aiding** transition to economic stability
4. **Addressing** structures in a community
“The main lesson of our analysis is that intergenerational mobility is a local problem, one that could potentially be tackled using place-based policies that strengthen economic growth rather than focusing on the individual.”

Raj Chetty is Professor of Economics at Harvard University and the Director of Opportunity Insights, which uses big data to study the science of economic opportunity: how we can give children from all backgrounds better chances of succeeding?

Chetty’s work has been widely cited in academia and policy discussions. He received numerous awards including a MacArthur “Genius” Fellowship and Harvard’s George Ledlie prize, awarded for research that made the most valuable contribution to science, or in any way for the benefit of mankind.
Timeline

- **April 19, 2022**: Tucson City Council Member Lane Santa Cruz invited Bonnie Bazata, Pima County’s Ending Poverty Now Program Manager to speak to Mayor and Council on poverty emerging from the pandemic.
- **Unanimous vote for a City/County Task Force focused on reducing poverty.**
- **June 7, 2022**: Presentation to Pima County Board of Supervisors.
- **Request for a detailed plan.**
- **Nov. 1, 2022**: Plan provided to the Board of Supervisors and approved.
- **Dec. 5, 2023**: Pima County Board of Supervisors approved.
- **Jan. 9, 2024**: City of Tucson’s Mayor and Council approved.
The Prosperity Initiative’s mandate was to work regionally to develop a set of policies that guide long-term efforts to create community wealth by addressing generational poverty and improving opportunity:

- Are based on evidence-based research
- Also address the immediate needs of those currently experiencing poverty
- For adoption or adaptation by local governments
Key Indicators

- Increases parent’s income
- Increases child’s income as adults
- Decreases expenses
- Increases/protects other assets
- Improves educational attainment
- Improves parent’s health
- Improves child’s health
- Reduces crime
- ROI
Guiding Principles

❖ Is this prevention or intervention?
❖ Is there a strategic and tactical element?
❖ Is there credible evidence-based research behind it?
❖ Is it supported by area experts, providers and those with lived experience?
❖ Is it applicable at the level of local government?
❖ Is there a potential return on investment?
❖ Is it targeting the parts of our community with the highest rates of poverty?
❖ Is it addressing and mitigating historic systemic inequities?
❖ Does this impact urban and smaller/rural communities differently?
❖ Can policies be grouped for greater impact?
❖ Are there any unintended consequences?
Right sizing the policy

Too little?
Program Area

Just right?
Policy for local government

Too big?
Advocacy Area
The County and the City are leading along with a 36 member Working Group that meets regularly.
Brian Mayer, Professor School of Sociology

Brian Mayer is a Professor of Sociology with the College of Social and Behavioral Sciences with expertise in the area of poverty as well as other areas. Dr. Mayer supported the Tucson Mayor's Poverty Commission from 2012-2014. He also developed the experiential learning Tucson Poverty Project class that incorporates community-based research approaches and has received recognition for his innovative work in teaching and community engagement.

His work in environmental sociology has examined the role of community activism and participation in the identification and management of potential environmental health risks.

Keith Bentele, SIROW Associate Research Professor

Keith Bentele, PhD, is an Associate Research Professor with the Southwest Institute of Research on Women (SIROW) in the College of Social and Behavioral Sciences and holds a Ph.D. in Sociology. Dr. Bentele’s research has examined state-level poverty rates, inequality, homelessness, and the generosity and accessibility of various safety-net programs.

He is interested in policy-relevant research with the potential to reduce poverty and homelessness. His specific areas of methodological expertise are in the use of quantitative methods and statistics.
Community and expert input is key

180 meetings with 750+ individuals
✓ Practitioners
✓ Academics
✓ Business sector
✓ People with lived experience

56+ national and local experts and practitioners

- Dr. Margaret Clancy, Center for Social Development Policy Director, Brown School at Washington University in St. Louis
- Dr. Atticus Jaramillo, UA Assistant Professor of Planning and Real Estate Development
- Dr. Elizabeth Krupinski, Emory University
- Dr. Eric Schindler, President/CEO for Child and Family Resources
- Dr. Erin Carr Jordan, President and CEO Digital Equity Institute
- Patrick Hain, Program Manager with the National League of Cities Economic Opportunity and Financial Empowerment

12 Commissions & Councils
1. City of South Tucson Mayor and Council
2. City of Tucson Equitable Housing and Development Commission
3. Marana Town Council
4. Metropolitan Education Commission
5. Sahuarita Town Council

Pima County
1. Board of Health
2. Library Board
3. Planning and Zoning Commission
4. Regional Affordable Housing Commission
5. Small Business Commission
6. Transportation Advisory Committee
7. Workforce Investment Board
“A child growing up in a low-income family experiences worse outcomes, on average, than a child from a higher income family in virtually every area.”

Research has shown that “the weight of the causal evidence does indeed indicate that income poverty itself causes negative child outcomes, especially when poverty occurs in early childhood or persists throughout a large portion of childhood.”

Reducing Intergenerational Poverty, National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine (NASEM)
Reducing Intergenerational Poverty

“Situation in which children who grow up in families with incomes below the poverty line are themselves poor as adults.”

• Among U.S. children born around 1980, one-third of children living in low-income households also had low household incomes in adulthood.

• Twice the 17% rate found among adults in their 30s who did not grow up in low-income households.

• Black children and Native American children have much lower rates of upward mobility (and higher rates of downward mobility) than White Americans.

• Black and Native American children are significantly more likely to grow up in high-poverty neighborhoods, which is also correlated with lower intergenerational mobility.

• Investing in children is the strongest ROI
We need equitable solutions
4 Policy Areas

- Education
- Critical Family Resources
- Asset Building & Infrastructure Priorities
- Cross Policy Strategies
EDUCATION

Increase Access to Quality Early Childhood Childcare and Education

• Increase access to affordable high quality early childcare and education for low-income families with children, ages birth to five.

Increase Pathways to Post Secondary Education

• Increase college and other post-secondary educational and training opportunities for children from low-income families by improving access to children’s college savings accounts.
CRITICAL FAMILY RESOURCES: Housing

Increase Housing Mobility and Opportunity
Increase the supply of housing by prioritizing practices and investments that focus on families with children and result in diverse housing types and prices in neighborhoods, ensuring affordable housing options are available throughout Pima County, especially in low poverty areas.

Improve Housing Stability
Improve housing stability among low-income renters and homeowners by preventing evictions and foreclosures, increasing homeownership, and reducing home energy efficiency and weatherization costs, especially for those in high poverty areas.
Arizona is ranked among the **five worst states** for affordable housing.

- For every **four families** that need it, **one home exists**.
# Fastest Metro-Level Rent Growth
Among 52 CBSAs with Population >1 Million

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Over Past 6 Months</th>
<th>Over Past 12 Months</th>
<th>Over Past 3 Years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#1</td>
<td>Chicago (+2%)</td>
<td>Cincinnati (+6%)</td>
<td>Tucson (+39%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2</td>
<td>Louisville (+1%)</td>
<td>Chicago (+6%)</td>
<td>Tampa (+39%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3</td>
<td>Boston (+1%)</td>
<td>Indianapolis (+5%)</td>
<td>Miami (+38%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4</td>
<td>Baltimore (+1%)</td>
<td>Louisville (+5%)</td>
<td>Rochester (+36%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5</td>
<td>Minneapolis (0%)</td>
<td>Kansas City (+5%)</td>
<td>Riverside (+34%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6</td>
<td>Memphis (0%)</td>
<td>Boston (+4%)</td>
<td>Orlando (+32%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#7</td>
<td>Houston (0%)</td>
<td>St. Louis (+4%)</td>
<td>San Diego (+31%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#8</td>
<td>Miami (0%)</td>
<td>Columbus (+4%)</td>
<td>Jacksonville (+31%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#9</td>
<td>Birmingham (0%)</td>
<td>New York (+4%)</td>
<td>Phoenix (+30%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#10</td>
<td>Providence (0%)</td>
<td>Pittsburgh (+3%)</td>
<td>Las Vegas (+30%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Apartment List Rent Estimates; data as of April 2023.
Data Available: [https://www.apartmentlist.com/research/category/data-rent-estimates](https://www.apartmentlist.com/research/category/data-rent-estimates)
CRITICAL FAMILY RESOURCES: Health

Increase Health Coverage & Reduce Medical Debt

• Provide healthcare insurance enrollment assistance to protect against medical debt.

Reduce Unintended Pregnancies

• Reduce unintended pregnancies by increasing access to contraception and improving use of long-acting reversible contraception, and through education.
CRITICAL FAMILY RESOURCES: Digital Inclusion & Workforce

Expand Broadband Services and Address Barriers to Digital Inclusion

• Expand broadband services and address barriers so all Pima County residents have access, equipment, and skills for digital inclusion and to expand opportunities for economic growth for rural communities.

Prioritize Workforce Development for Underserved Populations

• Prioritize workforce development for low-income job seekers with evidence-based case management practices that include apprenticeships, on the job training, and supportive services that prepares participants for jobs with self-sufficient wages and benefits.
ASSET BUILDING & INFRASTRUCTURE PRIORITIES:
Financial Capability and Small Business

Improve Financial Capability
• Improve the financial capability of low-income families and small businesses to increase their access to fair credit and to gain and protect income and wealth building assets.

Support Small Business
• Increase small/micro business ownership and expansion opportunities. Efforts should prioritize entrepreneurs of color, women-owned businesses and businesses operating in high poverty neighborhoods and rural areas.
ASSET BUILDING & INFRASTRUCTURE PRIORITIES: Transportation and Job Quality

Prioritize Transportation Options to Connect Disadvantaged Communities to Jobs and Resources

- Identify and prioritize safe, reliable, and affordable transportation options and encourage mixed-use and transit-oriented developments where appropriate, to better connect disadvantaged communities with jobs and other resources, and reduce travel times, traffic injuries, transportation costs, and air pollution.

Improve Job Quality for Low-Income Workers

- Improve job quality for low-income workers and expand the employment capacity of employers already offering quality jobs, with quality jobs defined as those that offer competitive, equitable and self-sustaining wages, family friendly benefits and practices, and consistent scheduling.
ASSET BUILDING & INFRASTRUCTURE PRIORITIES: Neighborhoods

Improve Quality of Life and Opportunity in High Poverty Areas

- Improve quality of life and opportunity in high poverty areas by investing in both physical and social infrastructure in ways that intentionally strive to center the priorities of local residents, improve access to resources, prevent the displacement of vulnerable residents, reduce the exposure to violence and build community wealth in these high poverty areas.
Cross Policy Strategies

- **Center a 2GEN Approach**
  Center family voice and participation in the development of policies, programs, and practices.

- **Address Climate Resilience & Environmental Justice**
  Build a more climate resilient community while reducing the potential harm to low-income areas from hazardous waste and contaminants, air pollution, environmental degradation, resource extraction, and other land uses.

- **Prevent & Reduce Crime**
  Reduce and prevent crime in neighborhoods, as well as reduce and prevent youth involvement in crime and the criminal justice system.
Cross Policy Analysis of Key Indicators

1. Increases parent’s income
2. Increases child’s income as adults
3. Decreases expenses
4. Increases/protects other assets
5. Improves educational attainment
6. Improves parent’s health
7. Improves child’s health
8. Reduces crime
9. ROI
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy</th>
<th>Increases Parents Income</th>
<th>Increases Child's Income as Adults</th>
<th>Decreases expenses</th>
<th>Increases/Protects other assets</th>
<th>Improves educational attainment</th>
<th>Improves parent’s health</th>
<th>Improves child's health</th>
<th>Reduces Crime</th>
<th>Totals</th>
<th>ROI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FC</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DI</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECE</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSE</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HMOB</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HST</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UP</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WKD</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRAN</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEIGH</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JQ</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BUS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2GEN</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLIM</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRC</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy area</td>
<td># of outcomes</td>
<td>ROI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase Access to Quality Early Childhood Education</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase Housing Mobility and Opportunity</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prioritize Transportation Options to Connect Disadvantaged Communities to Jobs and Resources</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduce Unintended Pregnancies</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expand Broadband Services and Address Barriers to Digital Inclusion</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve Housing Stability</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase Health Coverage &amp; Reduce Medical Debt</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase Pathways to Post Secondary Education</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevent and Reduce Crime</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address Climate Resilience &amp; Environmental Justice</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve Job Quality for Low-Income Workers</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve Quality of Life and Opportunity in High Poverty Areas</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center a 2GEN Approach</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improve Financial Capability</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prioritize Workforce Development for Underserved Populations</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EVIDENCE THAT BUNDLING POLICIES WILL HAVE A GREATER IMPACT

Bundling policies “offers some formidable advantages over an individual program approach.” *

*From the National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine (NASEM) report, A Roadmap for Reducing Child Poverty
The Prosperity Initiative provides a strategic framework
guides resource allocation decisions across departments and time
aligns and coordinates resources for greater impact
guides grant opportunity decisions and makes us more competitive
identifies where other strategies are missing and needed
NEXT STEPS: **SCAN, ANALYZE & REALIGN**

Scan, analyze and realign local government operations and investments to best implement the policies, with guidance of multi-departmental teams.

❖ Working to establish a financial tracking system on where and how the County is already investing and where future investments happen.
Urban Institute’s Mobility Action Learning Network

- Year long technical assistance for advancing locally driven programs, policies, and actions that boost upward mobility from poverty and achieve racial equity.
- Network with 26 other cities and counties
- Measuring Impact track.
- Local team
REPORTING ON IMPACT

❖ How do we report out our progress?
  o UA MAP Dashboard
  o City of Tucson’s Equity Maps
  o Pima County’s Broadband maps
  o United Way’s Cradle to Career
UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA COLLABORATIONS

Housing, health, interns, reports
❖ Continue to engage in a regional approach to implementation by regularly engaging with participating local governments.

❖ Supporting a multisector approach that would bring together representatives from business, nonprofits, education, philanthropy, and the faith community, as well as neighborhoods and unincorporated parts of Pima County.

❖ Continue to develop partnerships with the Tohono O’odham Nation, Pascua Yaqui Tribe, Native American organizations, and community members.
The Sonoran Desert Conservation Plan took almost two decades to be fully implemented.

It guided investments that has ensured that our fragile desert can sustain life and will be enjoyed for generations to come.
The Prosperity Initiative is an opportunity to be architects of change for the next generation.
Bonnie Bazata
Ending Poverty Now Program Manager
(520) 724-3704 (o)
(520) 247-6011 (c)
bonnie.bazata@pima.gov